

Collaborative governance for lesbian in prison in Indonesia: a literature review

Cahyoko Edi Tando¹, Mulyani Rahayu²

¹Prodi Bimbingan Kemasyarakatan, ²Prodi Manajemen Pemasarakatan, Politeknik Ilmu Pemasarakatan, BPSDM Hukum dan HAM
Jl. Raya Gandul, No 4, Depok 16514, Indonesia.

Corresponding author

¹cahyoyoko7@gmail.com

Abstract: Lesbian cases in prison in Indonesia that are happening at this time should be of concern to all parties, not only the prison Institutional authorities, but also involving health agencies which are the realm of their authority when infectious diseases occur in prisons. Therefore, a mechanism for inter-agency cooperation or collaborative governance, including involvement with the community, is also needed as an effort to monitor the case. The research method uses a literature review with several reputable journal articles. The purpose of the research will be input to interested parties in prison management, including those who may cooperate with prisons, including health agencies authorities. The results will be in the form of recommendations from several scientific articles which are summarized using certain methods in accordance with the rules of Literature review so that it will facilitate the flow of data submission, the use of year limits in the publication of each scientific article will be considered a novelty in this research so that it will add insight and understanding of lesbian cases in women's prisons in Indonesia.

Keywords: Helath, Lesbian, Literature Review, Women's Prison.

Introduction

The condition of same-sex is a case that is becoming very phenomenal at this time. So that it creates a lot of harmony and anxiety in the community. In the scope of society, we can hear some through several electronic print media about this, for example (Detik.com, 2022) who reported that there was a case regarding deviant sex in a military institution in Indonesia where the perpetrator was jailed for 7 months. Then through (jabar.kemenag.go.id, 2017) which discusses in its entirety the relation of this phenomenon to Islamic law and norms that exist in Indonesia and Indonesian culture as a whole.

On the other hand, the problem of same-sex cases also occurs during a criminal period by a convict, namely when he is in a prison institution. Data from the Directorate General of Corrections (*Direktorat Jenderal Pemasarakatan*) lesbian cases are same-sex and it is very difficult to detect in this case there are only 2 reasons, namely already being

a lesbian before being in prison or being a lesbian in prison as a result of biological needs that are not can be fulfilled (*see* liputan6.com, 2019; news.detik.com, 2019). Research conducted by Sandi et al (2015) and Sulistyawan (2018) both of these factors are very common in prisons when someone has suffered from being a lesbian in the past and also recently became a lesbian in prisons due to biological factors that cannot be prevented as normal human beings, but due to the limited conditions of prisons and they are currently serving a sentence then it must be limited to channeling these biological desires.

As a result of same-sex acts, it will result in many things, namely HIV transmission, venereal diseases, damage to the nervous system, and even psychological disorders in the long term (Brinkley-Rubinstein et al., 2019; Faust, 2021). The portion of the annual budget in prisons for the health sector is still 10 million rupiah for each prison in Indonesia with a total of 529 prisons in 2019, assuming only 24,700 per day are given to inmates for health

matters, data from the Directorate General of Corrections for 2018 prison residents in Indonesia reached 256,273 people with a total capacity of 126,164 people or an overcapacity of 203%. On the other hand, the Corrections Law number 22 of 2022 stipulates that the provision of health services is a right that must be fulfilled by convicts, so seeing this very phenomenal case, it is impossible for prisons to be able to work alone in dealing with lesbian cases in prisons.

Through public administration science, there is a collaborative governance mechanism that needs to be considered, namely the involvement of various parties to support the smooth running and problem solving of various problems in the public sector (Agbodzakey & Taylor, 2019; Burke, 2014). Then in this article there will be more efforts that must be made by prisons and other parties in the context of preventing and recovering lesbians in prisons in Indonesia. So that the inmates will be healthy and not infected with various kinds of diseases caused by same-sex (Dara et al., 2015; Polymenopoulou, 2018). As for the formulation of the problem in this research is how collaborative governance in solving cases of same-sex in prisons. while for the purpose of writing this article is to analyze more deeply about how inter-governmental collaboration, especially prisons, is involved in the prevention and recovery of lesbians, so that the results of this research will become a reference and provide input to stakeholders such as prisons, the Directorate General of Corrections, or other parties involved.

Materials and Methods

Research methods

This study will use a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) approach. Using a literature review approach, of course, researchers will find it easier to analyze in later discussions, of course, supported by valid literature sources and have a good track record. This research only uses good and correct literature sources and there is no indication that it leads to predatory publications. This SLR method research has 3 steps, referring to (Kitchenham &

Charters, 2007). The explanation below is as follows:

Procedures

Database

The steps in this study will refer to the method used in the SLR method by (Kitchenham et al., 2010; Kitchenham & Charters, 2007) where for the first stage is to determine the database. The databases that have been determined are the Scopus database, Taylor And Francis Group, and Google Scholar because they have been widely recognized by academics (Bates et al., 2017; Bramer et al., 2017).

Elimination

Use keywords in the search for articles, namely lesbians and prisons. This study will only use journal articles with relevant scope and discussion to answer the problem formulation, as well as other journals that are relevant to the topic of the problem raised. Meanwhile, to determine the novelty of the article, the year publication limit is used, namely only in the 2011-2021 period (Denyer & Tranfield, 2009; Kitchenham et al., 2010; Xiao & Watson, 2019).

Analysis result paper

To find quality articles, researchers will carry out several stages including selecting articles (Wahono, 2015), namely by (1) eliminating articles that are not the result of field research, (2) eliminating articles that are not open access, (3) eliminating articles in the form of book reviews, conference results, book chapters and in the form of working papers and (4) eliminating articles which are not included in the social science scope. (5) elimination of articles that do not use the official language, namely English. In the final step, it will be compiled with a narrative presentation of data based on the search results of the article. Thus, the results of this study will be arranged systematically and in accordance with the research principles of the SLR method (Galvan & Melisa, 2017; Xiao & Watson, 2019).

Results and Discussion

Involvement of religious institutions to strengthen the religion of the inmates

The first thing that can be done with collaborative governance in same-sex cases is by involving religious institutions to provide religious reinforcement in lesbian cases in prisons. It is known that the religious sector is needed where lesbians will be more directed to spiritual approaches for both Muslims and non-Muslims. Religious agencies, for example through mosque takmir, religious community harmony forums, or related agencies that are able to provide good rehabilitation for these inmates (Jackman, 2020; Suen & Chan, 2020). On the other hand, religious activities are expected to provide refreshment and also provide good habits to inmates to always draw closer to the Almighty because lesbianism is a same-sex act and is strictly prohibited by any religion, in addition, referring to the 2022 Criminal Code which new, in article 414 which prohibits acts of same-sex obscenity and of course will burden the perpetrators, especially those actions that occur in prisons.

Aggravation will also be carried out with an additional sentence period which will give a deterrent effect to the perpetrators and the victims can of course be a reminder to the perpetrators not to try the act of adultery (Janssen & Scheepers, 2019; Woodell & Schwadel, 2020). Thus, in prison, identified lesbians certainly do not have time to direct these activities because their days are already filled with positive religious coaching activities.

Opinion from Kolysh (2017) environment is one of the factors that cause someone to have same-sex. This also applies in prisons, where the environment causes a prisoner to be able to do so because of the encouragement factor of his limited biological needs. This is compounded by the identification of Lesbian characteristics from convicts who originally had same-sex. Opinion from Barnes & Meyer (2012) based on the results of his research on same-sex, there are indications that the role of religion is very decisive for a person to be separated from this same-sex. This research refers to the reason that no religion will approve of

this action so that religion will become a stronghold and become a guideline for life and will make people healthy and free from the negative influences of the surrounding environment.

The involvement of religious institutions in prisons can occur by conducting regular recitations (see Regional Office Public Relations, 2021; Rohim, 2021) which is carried out in several prisons with the aim of increasing the faith and piety of convicts and also does not rule out the possibility of being a reminder to convicts to be able to change for the better when reintegrating later. The same opinion was also expressed by Edliq (2021) treatment of prisoners in prisons is fair and humane, there is no discrimination that can be done by prison officials while the prisoner is serving his sentence. Thus, religious activities must be a prioritized priority program in addition to adding other programs to improve the capabilities and experience of the convicts themselves.

Involvement of health agencies for the prevention of infectious diseases

Health provided by prisons is very limited, not a few prisons only have 1 health worker and no more than 5 nurses, besides that medicines in prisons are also limited considering the current condition of the allocation of funding for health in Indonesia is limited and coupled with activities consumption, which consumes a large portion of the daily budget for prisons, is 17 thousand per day in 2021, which was originally only 15 thousand per day in 2018. Meanwhile, the total funds for 2018 that must be spent by the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of the Republic of Indonesia is 1.3 trillion per year, only for food.

In addition, lesbian cases that should not have happened in prisons certainly add to the burden of prisons to provide more budgetary portions for health services, on the other hand, collaborative governance also provides convenience to prisons by cooperating with health unit (*puskesmas*) or hospitals who are willing to work together in handling health cases in Prisons are primarily for prevention and also treatment of convicts. Health cases are very important for prisons, where prisons are closed places and there is no access to the outside world, so it is necessary to have guard staff

who have experience in observing and observing the health of each prisoner.

Several health cases that can befall prisoners include HIV/AIDS, skin diseases, tuberculosis, and several other diseases. In addition, the condition of prisons inhabited by convicts for a certain period of time, of course, prisons must make rules to maintain cleanliness and obey each other in order in prisons. Apart from that, for prevention, of course, you have to cooperate with women's protection, especially in lesbian cases where they are victims of coercion by other convicts, because the Correctional Law number 22 of 2022 still explains the right of every convict to get legal protection when subjected to violence in prisons, including sexual violence, especially same-sex.

Prevention of infectious diseases caused by same-sex in prisons must be controlled by involving other parties, especially those in charge of health. One of the prisons that does this is Sukamara Prison in Central Kalimantan Province in collaboration with the local health office, this collaboration includes early prevention, efforts to fulfill medicines and basic health checks for each prisoner. Then Bengkalis Prison which is in Riau Province involves the health office and the collaboration is in the form of an MoU (Memorandum of Understanding).

In the health sector in prisons, of course, it is the responsibility of all parties, not only from the prison itself but also must involve the health service, it could be from the private sector, for example from CSR (corporate social responsibility) funds, namely a hospital in Jakarta that offers this assistance to prisons. in Cipinang in improving health services to prisoners. Given that conditions in prisons are the most densely populated areas and prone to disease transmission, of course there must be early prevention, including if there are indications of same-sex.

Conclusions

Based on the results of the research above, there are at least 2 things that can be drawn in this study, which are related to collaborative governance in prisons related to lesbians, namely by engaging in religious activities so that the inmates can be aware

and stop the actions that have gone astray so that there are no Another case of lesbians that will occur in Indonesia when all inmates, especially women, are aware that this act is a sin and adultery. Then by carrying out cross-organizational collaboration, namely with health agencies in providing health services in prisons which are currently limited. Thus, the inmates will of course be monitored for their health and avoid infectious diseases such as HIV or AIDS, venereal diseases, skin diseases and others that can be transmitted due to same-sex.

References

- Agbodzakey, J., & Taylor, L. (2019). Collaborative governance and role of the Grantee in HIV/AIDS health services: the Broward County of South Florida experience. *International Review of Public Administration*, 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.1080/12294659.2019.1622856>
- Barnes, DM, & Meyer, IH (2012). Religious Affiliation, Internalized Homophobia, and Mental Health in Lesbians, Gay Men, and Bisexuals. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 82(4), 505–515. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1939-0025.2012.01185.x>
- Bates, J., Best, P., McQuilkin, J., & Taylor, B. (2017). Will Web Search Engines Replace Bibliographic Databases in the Systematic Identification of Research? *Journal of Academic Librarianship*, 43(1), 8–17. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.acalib.2016.11.003>
- Bramer, WM, Rethlefsen, ML, Kleijnen, J., & Franco, OH (2017). Optimal database combinations for literature searches in systematic reviews: A prospective exploratory study. *Systematic Reviews*, 6(1), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13643-017-0644-y>
- Brinkley-Rubinstein, L., Peterson, M., Zaller, ND, & Wohl, DA (2019). Best practices for identifying men who have sex with men for corrections-based pre-exposure prophylaxis provision. *Health and Justice*, 7(1), 0–3. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40352-019-0088-7>
- Burke, BF (2014). Understanding Intergovernmental Relations, Twenty-five Years Hence. *State and Local Government Review*, 46(1), 63–76. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0160323x13520461>
- Dara, M., Acosta, CD, Melchers, NVSV, Al-Darraj, HAA, Chorghiani, D., Reyes, H., Centis, R., Sotgiu, G., D'Ambrosio, L., Chadha, SS, & Migliori, GB (2015). Tuberculosis control in prisons: Current situation and research gaps. *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 32, 111–117. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2014.12.029>
- Denyer, D., & Tranfield, D. (2009). Producing a Systematic Review. In *The SAGE Handbook of Organizational Research Methods* (pp. 671–689).
- detik.com. (2022). An LGBT TNI couple in East Java was sentenced to 7 months in jail and fired. <https://www.detik.com/jateng/Hukum-dan-kriminal/d->

- 6433633/sejoli-oknum-tni-lgbt-di-jatim-divonis-bui-7-bulan-dan-difired
- Edliq, A. (2021). Prayers in Prisons? The Politics and Performance of Christian Faith-Based Initiatives in the US. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Student Research and Scholarship*, 5(1), 1–33.
- Faust, F. (2021). The prisoner citizen: juridification and the AIDS activist struggle for harm reduction in German prisons. *Critical Public Health*, 31(1), 17–29. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09581596.2020.1841113>
- Galvan, JL, & Melisa, G. (2017). *Writing Literature Reviews: a Guide for Students of the Social and Behavioral Sciences* (7th ed.). Taylor and Francis.
- Regional Public Relations Office. (2021). Routine Recitation Activities at Sampit Prison are a Form of Guidance for WBP. <https://kalteng.kemerkumham.go.id/berita-kanwil/berita-utama/8568-activity-pengajian-rutin-di-lapas-sampit-salah-satu-formasi-pembinaan-kepada-wbp>
- jabar.kemerkumham.go.id. (2017). The Bekasi LGBT Phenomenon: Between Human Rights, Law, and Religion. <https://jabar.kemerkumham.go.id/portal/read/fenomena-lgbt-bekasi-antara-hak-asasi-human-hukum-dan-agama>
- Jackman, M. (2020). Religion, Contact, and Ambivalent Attitudes Toward the Rights of Gays and Lesbians in Barbados. *Journal of Homosexuality*, 67(11), 1512–1532. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00918369.2019.1601434>
- Janssen, DJ, & Scheepers, P. (2019). How Religion Shapes Rejection of Homosexuality Across the Globe. *Journal of Homosexuality*, 66(14), 1974–2001. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00918369.2018.1522809>
- Kitchenham, B., & Charters, SM (2007). Guidelines for performing Systematic Literature Reviews in Software Engineering. EBSE Technical Report.
- Kitchenham, B., Pretorius, R., Budgen, D., Brereton, OP, Turner, M., Niazi, M., & Linkman, S. (2010). Systematic literature reviews in software engineering – A tertiary study. *Information and Software Technology*, 52(8), 792–805. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infsof.2010.03.006>
- Kolysh, S. (2017). Straight Gods, White Devils: Exploring Paths to Non-Religion in the Lives of Black LGBTQ People. *Secularism and Nonreligion*, 6(2), 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.5334/snr.83>
- Bengkalis Prison. (2018). Prevent HIV/AIDS, Bengkalis Prison and Health Office Sign MoU. Health Office. [Bengkalis.go. Id. https://dinkes.bengkalis.go.id/index.php?com=isi&id_news=76](https://dinkes.bengkalis.go.id/index.php?com=isi&id_news=76)
- Sukamara Prison. (2021). Realizing Optimal Health Services, Sukamara Prison Extends MoU with Health Office. [Lapassukamara.Kemerkumham.Go.Id. https://lapassukamara.kemerkumham.go.id/berita-utama/Jadikan-pelayanan-kesehatan-yang-optimal-lapas-sukamara-perpanjang-mou-bersama-dinkes](https://lapassukamara.kemerkumham.go.id/berita-utama/Jadikan-pelayanan-kesehatan-yang-optimal-lapas-sukamara-perpanjang-mou-bersama-dinkes)
- liputan6.com. (2019). Phenomenon of Gay and Lesbian Convicts in Correctional Institutions, Due to Over Capacity? [Www.Liputan6.Com. https://www.liputan6.com/news/read/4008889/fenomena-napi-gay-dan-lesbian-di-lapas-akibat-over-kapasitas](https://www.liputan6.com/news/read/4008889/fenomena-napi-gay-dan-lesbian-di-lapas-akibat-over-kapasitas)
- news.detik.com. (2019). Ministry of Law and Human Rights to Segregate LGBT Prisoners to "Isolation Room." [https://News.Detik.Com/. https://news.detik.com/berita/d-4619332/kemerkumham-akan-separatkan-napi-lgbt-ke-kamar-isolasi](https://News.Detik.Com/)
- Polymenopoulou, E. (2018). LGBTI Rights in Indonesia: A Human Rights Perspective. *Asia Pacific Journal on Human Rights and the Law*, 19(1), 27–44. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15718158-01901002>
- Rohim, Z. (2021). Recitation of WBP Lapas Serang to Increase Faith and Devotion. <https://lapasserang.id/pengajian-wbp-lapas-serang-untuk-dindingkan-keimanan-dan-ketaqwaan/>
- Sandi, AG, Halim, A., & Manurung, I. (2015). The Relationship between Length of Detention Period and Sexual Behavior of Drug Convicts in Correctional Institutions. *Journal of Nursing*, XI(1), 21–26.
- Suen, YT, & Chan, RCH (2020). Relationship Between Religion and Non-Heterosexuality: A Study of Lesbian, Gay and Bisexual People of Diverse Religions in China. *Journal of Sex Research*, 1036–1047. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00224499.2020.1782316>
- Sulistiyawan, AY (2018). Building a Legal Model That Pays Attention to the Sexual Needs of Prisoners in Correctional Institutions: A Study of the Constructivism Paradigm. *Journal of Law Science*, 4(1), 213–228. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv5jxq2k.87>
- Wahono, RS (2015). A Systematic Literature Review of Software Defect Prediction: Research Trends, Datasets, Methods and Frameworks. *Journal of Software Engineering*, 1(1), 1–16.
- Woodell, B., & Schwadel, P. (2020). Changes in Religiosity Among Lesbian, Gay, and Bisexual Emerging Adults. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 59(2), 379–396. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jssr.12653>
- Xiao, Y., & Watson, M. (2019). Guidance on Conducting a Systematic Literature Review. *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 39(1), 93–112. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0739456X17723971>